



**CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFQ EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION (SHORTLIST)**

**RFQ / TITLE: 626-10881 / CIVIL ENGINEERING CONSULTANT SERVICES
DATE: 3/27/12**

<u>CONSULTANT FIRM</u>	<u>FINAL RANKING</u>	<u>AVERAGE RANKING</u>	<u>SHORTLISTED</u>
URS Corporation Southern	1	5.42	Yes
Atkins North America	2	6.42	Yes
Calvin, Giordano	2	6.42	Yes
Craven Thompson & Associates	3	6.48	Yes
Keith and Schnars	4	6.52	Yes
Miller Legg & Associates	5	7.60	Yes
Tetra Tech	6	7.77	Yes
Wade Trim	7	8.33	Yes
King Engineering	8	8.43	Yes
The Corradino Group	9	8.47	Yes
A.D.A. Engineering	10	10.03	No
CSA Central	11	10.87	No
R.J. Behar	12	10.88	No
GAI Consultants	13	11.33	No
Chen Moore and Associates	14	12.60	No
Florida Transportation Engineering	15	13.22	No
AMEC Environmental	16	13.32	No
Langan Engineering and Environmental	17	15.28	No
CIMA Engineering	18	15.97	No
CPH Engineering	19	16.15	No
Pillar Consultants	20	19.08	No
Crain Atlantis Engineering	21	20.17	No

PROPOSER:	AMEC Environmental					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	3	3.75	3.75	10.5	3.50
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	4.5	2	4	10.5	3.50
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	4	3.5	5.25	12.75	4.25
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	2.2	2.4	1.6	6.2	2.07
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		13.7	11.65	14.6	39.95	13.32

PROPOSER:	A.D.A. Engineering					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	4	2.75	2.75	9.5	3.17
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	2	3.25	2.5	7.75	2.58
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	2	1.5	3	6.5	2.17
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	1.4	1.8	3	6.2	2.07
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05
TOTAL POINTS		9.45	9.35	11.3	30.1	10.03

PROPOSER:	Atkins North America					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	1.5	1.5	0.5	3.5	1.17
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	3	0.25	2.25	5.5	1.83
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	2.5	2	1.75	6.25	2.08
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	1	0.4	2.6	4	1.33
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		8	4.15	7.1	19.25	6.42

PROPOSER:	Calvin, Giordano & Associates						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	0.25	1.75	4	6	2.00	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	1.5	2.25	1.25	5	1.67	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	1	2.25	1.25	4.5	1.50	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	0.2	1	2.4	3.6	1.20	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05	
TOTAL POINTS		3	7.3	8.95	19.25	6.42	

PROPOSER:	Chen Moore and Associates						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	2	2	3.5	7.5	2.50	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	4.25	1.75	3.75	9.75	3.25	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	4.25	2.75	5	12	4.00	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	3	2.2	3.2	8.4	2.80	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05	
TOTAL POINTS		13.55	8.75	15.5	37.8	12.60	

PROPOSER:	CIMA Engineering						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	4.5	4.75	2	11.25	3.75	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	4.75	4.75	5.5	15	5.00	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	1.25	4.75	4.25	10.25	3.42	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	3.8	4	3.6	11.4	3.80	
Accept City P-Card	0.05				0	0.00	
TOTAL POINTS		14.3	18.25	15.35	47.9	15.97	

PROPOSER:	CPH Engineering						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	5	3.5	5.25	13.75	4.58	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	5.5	3.75	3.25	12.5	4.17	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	5	3.75	4.5	13.25	4.42	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	4	3	1.8	8.8	2.93	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05	
TOTAL POINTS		19.55	14.05	14.85	48.45	16.15	

PROPOSER:		Crain Atlantis Engineering				
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg		
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	5.5	5.5	5.5	16.5	5.50
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	5.25	5	4.5	14.75	4.92
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	5.5	5.25	5.5	16.25	5.42
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	4.4	4.2	4.4	13	4.33
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		20.65	19.95	19.9	60.5	20.17

PROPOSER:		Craven Thompson & Associates				
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg		
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	1	0.75	4.5	6.25	2.08
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	0.5	1.5	0.25	2.25	0.75
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	2.25	2.5	2	6.75	2.25
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	0.8	1.2	2.2	4.2	1.40
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		4.55	5.95	8.95	19.45	6.48

PROPOSER:		CSA Central				
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg		
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	4.25	1	1.75	7	2.33
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	2.75	1.25	4.75	8.75	2.92
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	4.5	1.25	3.75	9.5	3.17
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	3.6	1.6	2	7.2	2.40
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05
TOTAL POINTS		15.15	5.15	12.3	32.6	10.87

PROPOSER:		Florida Transportation Engineering				
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg		
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	3.5	5	1.25	9.75	3.25
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	2.5	5.25	0.5	8.25	2.75
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	4.75	5	0.5	10.25	3.42
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	3.4	3.8	4.2	11.4	3.80
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		14.15	19.05	6.45	39.65	13.22

PROPOSER:	GAI Consultants					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	1.25	4.25	2.25	7.75	2.58
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	2.25	4.25	3	9.5	3.17
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	0.5	4.25	4	8.75	2.92
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	1.2	3.4	3.4	8	2.67
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		5.2	16.15	12.65	34	11.33

PROPOSER:	Keith and Schnars					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	0.75	1.25	2.5	4.5	1.50
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	1.25	1	1.75	4	1.33
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	0.75	1.75	4.75	7.25	2.42
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	0.4	0.6	2.8	3.8	1.27
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		3.15	4.6	11.8	19.55	6.52

PROPOSER:	King Engineering					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	4.75	3.25	0.25	8.25	2.75
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	1.75	2.5	0.75	5	1.67
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	1.5	0.5	3.5	5.5	1.83
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	3.2	2	1.2	6.4	2.13
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05
TOTAL POINTS		11.25	8.3	5.75	25.3	8.43

PROPOSER:	Langan Engineering and Environmental					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	3.75	4.5	4.75	13	4.33
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	4	4.5	5.25	13.75	4.58
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	3.5	4.5	0.75	8.75	2.92
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	2.8	3.6	3.8	10.2	3.40
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05
TOTAL POINTS		14.1	17.15	14.6	45.85	15.28

PROPOSER:	Miller Legg & Associates						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	0.5	2.25	4.25	7	2.33	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	0.25	2.75	2	5	1.67	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	0.25	3.25	2.5	6	2.00	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	0.6	2.8	1.4	4.8	1.60	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00	
TOTAL POINTS		1.6	11.05	10.15	22.8	7.60	

PROPOSER:	Pillar Consultants						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	5.25	5.25	5	15.5	5.17	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	5	5.5	5	15.5	5.17	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	5.25	5.5	2.75	13.5	4.50	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	4.2	4.4	4	12.6	4.20	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.15	0.05	
TOTAL POINTS		19.75	20.7	16.8	57.25	19.08	

PROPOSER:	R.J. Behar						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	3.25	2.5	3	8.75	2.92	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	3.75	3	2.75	9.5	3.17	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	3.75	3	2.25	9	3.00	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	2.6	2.6	0.2	5.4	1.80	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00	
TOTAL POINTS		13.35	11.1	8.2	32.65	10.88	

PROPOSER:	Tetra Tech						
EVALUATION CRITERIA	WEIGHTED FACTOR	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all Ranking	Average Ranking	
		Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg			
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	2.5	0.5	1	4	1.33	
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	3.5	0.75	4.25	8.5	2.83	
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	2.75	1	3.25	7	2.33	
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	2	0.8	1	3.8	1.27	
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00	
TOTAL POINTS		10.75	3.05	9.5	23.3	7.77	

PROPOSER:	The Corradino Group					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	2.25	3	1.5	6.75	2.25
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	0.75	4	1	5.75	1.92
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	3.25	4	0.25	7.5	2.50
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	1.6	3.2	0.6	5.4	1.80
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		7.85	14.2	3.35	25.4	8.47

PROPOSER:	URS Corporation Southern					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	2.75	0.25	0.75	3.75	1.25
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	3.25	0.5	1.5	5.25	1.75
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	3	0.25	1	4.25	1.42
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	2.4	0.2	0.4	3	1.00
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		11.4	1.2	3.65	16.25	5.42

PROPOSER:	Wade Trim					
	WEIGHTED	COMMITTEE MEMBER			Total all	Average
EVALUATION CRITERIA	FACTOR	Fernando Blanco	Herb Stanley	Steve Hillberg	Ranking	Ranking
Qualifications of Firm	0.25	1.75	4	3.25	9	3.00
Qualifications of Projec Team	0.25	1	3.5	3.5	8	2.67
Approach to Scope of Work	0.25	1.75	0.75	1.5	4	1.33
Previous Similar Projects	0.2	1.8	1.4	0.8	4	1.33
Accept City P-Card	0.05	0	0	0	0	0.00
TOTAL POINTS		6.3	9.65	9.05	25	8.33